PURPOSE:

The purpose of this Regional Design Instruction (RDI) is to enhance communication during the design process by establishing a uniform method for obtaining review comments, responding to those comments and documenting their resolution.

BACKGROUND:

One objective of the Region 4 Quality Control Plan is to identify steps in the project development process that require an independent quality control review. These independent reviews are an essential component to producing a quality product. Equally important to the project review is the documentation/resolution of the comments. It is important that the disposition of all comments be documented, formally addressed and incorporated into the final product (as appropriate). This process will help assure Group Directors that the project will meet quality expectations. The procedure is included in the updated Region 4 Quality Control Plan which will be issued under a separate RDI.

POLICY:

This policy requires that ALL project reviews, from this point forward, follow the established comment resolution process, effective immediately.

PROCEDURE: See attached.

TRANSMITTED MATERIAL: None

Contact: Joshua Brasacchio, RQCE, (585) 272-4824

References: Region 4 Quality Control Plan

Reference File Location: PDM Appendix 13

Key Words: comments, reviews, resolution, documentation
PROJECT REVIEWS AND COMMENT RESOLUTION PROCEDURE

CATEGORIES OF REVIEW COMMENTS

Review comments will be categorized under one of the following two categories:

**Major Comments**

Major comments concern issues of non-conformance with Department or Federal policies, procedures, standards, rules and regulations. Ultimately, it is up to the reviewer to determine if their comment falls under this category. All major comments require a formal written response.

**Miscellaneous Comments**

Miscellaneous comments are those comments or recommendations provided for project improvement which are intended to improve the quality of the project and its documentation. This could include individual preference, practices that have not been adopted as policy, drafting errors and typos which are noted during the review process. These comments do not require a formal written response.

COMMENT RESPONSE / DOCUMENTATION

**Major Comments**

All major comments made by reviewers shall be provided to the Job Manager by memos, e-mail or letters. If the reviewers comments are marked on the plans/report it is the reviewers responsibility to write out those comments that they want a response to. Job Managers are **NOT** required to respond to comments that are not written out. The responses shall be in writing and shall be formatted in a manner that identifies the reviewer’s comments and the Job Managers responses to the comments. Refer to attached sample Comment Response Memo. As a courtesy to Job Managers, all reviewers are encouraged to provide comments in an electronic format to facilitate the preparation of the Comment Response Memo.

The Comment Response Memo shall be a compilation of all comments received by all reviewers including a section identifying all individuals who were asked to comment but did not provide any comments. When the Comment Response Memo is complete it shall be sent to **ALL** individuals included in the original review request memo. This will facilitate the sharing of information between Regional Functional Groups

The Comment Response Memo is intended to be used for all design report reviews, ADP reviews and any pre-PS&E or PS&E reviews. The Comment Response Memo shall remain active during the life of the project. That is, the memo will typically be created during the design report phase and also used to document all comments during the final design phase. When the design phase is complete, the Comment Response Memo shall be provided to the EIC as part of the transfer package.

It is the Design Supervisor’s responsibility to ensure that the Comment Response Memo is completed.
**Miscellaneous Comments**

Miscellaneous comments made by reviewers usually involve items of preference or professional judgments more than policy matters, so therefore the Job Manager decides how to revise the plans/report to reflect the review comments and **NO** formal written response is required.

**REVIEWER “SIGN OFF” ON COMMENTS**

In addition to the Comment Response Memo, all major comments made during the final design phase (ADP, Pre-PS&E, PS&E comments) need to be “signed off” on from all reviewers prior to obtaining the necessary PS&E Approval Signatures. The purpose of the “signoff” is to provide reviewers the opportunity to review the disposition of their comment(s) in their final form.

The following guidelines should be used to streamline and simplify the “sign off” process:

- The reviewer can indicate that the response contained in the Comment Response Memo is adequate and he/she does not need to see revised plans. An electronic “sign off” is acceptable.
- The Job Manager can submit revised plans to the reviewer with the changes included to obtain “sign off.”
- The Job Manager can provide one (1) set of final plans at their desk for review and obtain “sign off” from all reviewers.
- Job Managers can meet individually with reviewers to go over final plans together and obtain “sign off.”

When the reviewer is satisfied that their comments have been adequately addressed they shall initial a “signoff” sheet (See attached sample Reviewer Acceptance Memo). As stated above, an electronic “sign off” (e-mail) will be acceptable. This memo shall be attached to the plans when Regional PS&E Approval Signatures are requested.

**RESOLUTION OF DISPUTES**

Comment resolutions should involve discussions with the reviewer to clarify and resolve the issues or concerns. Every attempt should be made to resolve issues at the lowest possible level. If the reviewer(s) and the Job Manager/Designer do not agree with the outcome of a particular comment and the difference cannot be resolved, a Comment Resolution Meeting shall be held. The purpose of this meeting is to bring the reviewer(s), the Job Manager, the Design Supervisor together to have an open discussion to resolve the particular issue/comment. In addition, it may also be necessary to include the Regional Design Engineer, the reviewer’s supervisor, the reviewers Group Director or other Regional and MO experts if they can help resolve the conflict. The Job Manager is responsible for setting up the meeting and the RQCE will be responsible for determining the meeting agenda and facilitating the meeting to keep it on focus.
FINAL RESOLUTION SIGN OFF

Once the Job Manager is satisfied that all comments raised during the review process have been appropriately addressed he/she can then obtain the necessary Regional Approval Signatures to progress the project to letting.
COMMENT RESPONSE MEMO

RECONSTRUCTION OF ROUTE XX
TOWN OF XXXX, XXXXX COUNTY
PIN XXXX.XX

ADP COMMENTS
Compiled by XXXX

COMMENTS BY: X XXXXXX
DATE: JANUARY XX, 20XX

1. Comment: 
   XXXX
   Response: 
   XXXX

2. Comment: 
   XXXX
   Response: 
   XXXX

COMMENTS BY: X XXXXXX
DATE: JANUARY XX, 20XX

1. Comment: 
   XXXX
   Response: 
   XXXX

2. Comment: 
   XXXX
   Response: 
   XXXX

No comments were received from the following:

- List

Issued: 9/30/2008 Page 5 of 7 RDI 08-002
DRAFT DESIGN REPORT COMMENTS
Compiled by XXXX

COMMENTS BY: XXXXXXX
DATE: JANUARY XX, 20XX

1. Comment: 
   xxxx
   Response: 
   xxxx

2. Comment: 
   xxxx
   Response: 
   xxxx

COMMENTS BY: XXXXXXX
DATE: JANUARY XX, 20XX

1. Comment: 
   xxxx
   Response: 
   xxxx

2. Comment: 
   xxxx
   Response: 
   xxxx

No comments were received from the following:

- List
Reviewer Certification for Final PS&E Submission, PIN XXXX.XX

My comments have been adequately addressed on the above referenced project.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Reviewer</th>
<th>Initial</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities Engineer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landscape/Environmental</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality Control Engineer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructability Review</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey and Mapping</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resident Engineer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bridge Maintenance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geotechnical</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>